

# **Breackerie Wind Farm**

## **Environmental Impact Assessment Report Volume 1 Chapter 11: Cultural Heritage**

October 2023



# CONTENTS

|                                                    |          |
|----------------------------------------------------|----------|
| <b>11 CULTURAL HERITAGE</b>                        | <b>1</b> |
| Introduction .....                                 | 1        |
| Legislation, Policy and Guidance .....             | 2        |
| Consultation .....                                 | 5        |
| Scope of Assessment.....                           | 7        |
| Assessment Methodology and Significance.....       | 8        |
| Baseline Conditions .....                          | 11       |
| Identification and Assessment of Key Effects ..... | 14       |
| Cumulative Effects .....                           | 30       |
| Mitigation Measures and Monitoring .....           | 30       |
| Residual Effects .....                             | 30       |
| Summary .....                                      | 34       |
| References.....                                    | 35       |

## FIGURES

- Figure 11.1: Designated heritage assets and Zone of Theoretical Visibility (Hub Height)
- Figure 11.2: Proposed development layout and non-designated heritage records
- Figure 11.3: Panoramic Photomontage visualisation from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654)
- Figure 11.4: Photomontage Visualisation from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654), east of cairn mound
- Figure 11.5: Photomontage Visualisation from close to Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3653), Lochorodale Woods
- Figure 11.6: Wireframe Visualisation from Killellan dun (SM3670)
- Figure 11.7: Wireframe Visualisation from Achnaclach Fort (SM3692)
- Figure 11.8: Wireframe Visualisation from Cullan Doon Fort and Dun (SM3090)
- Figure 11.9: Wireframe Visualisation from Kilchrist Dun (SM3640)
- Figure 11.10: Wireframe Visualisation from Bealloch Hill (SM3639)
- Figure 11.11: Wireframe Visualisation from Cnoc Araich (SM3648)

## Photographic Plates

- Plate 11.1: View of Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking south-west from north-eastern approach
- Plate 11.2: View from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking north-east
- Plate 11.3: View from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking south/south-west, valley in foreground with ridgelines visible
- Plate 11.4: View from Northern Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3653) looking north/north-west toward Loch Orodale

Plate11.5: Insert 11.5. View from Killelan Dun (SM3670) looking north. Achnaclach Fort (SM3692) in middle-distance

**TABLES**

- Table 11.1: Planning Policy issues relevant to Cultural Heritage
- Table 11.2: Consultation Responses
- Table 11.3: Categorisation of Importance
- Table 11.4: Magnitude of Effect
- Table 11.5: Significance of Effects Matrix
- Table 11.6: Residual Effects

# 11 CULTURAL HERITAGE

## Introduction

- 11.1 This chapter considers the potential effects of Breackerie Wind Farm (the 'proposed development') on Cultural Heritage.
- 11.2 This chapter is also supported by the following figures as contained within Volume 2: Figures:
- Figure 11.1: Designated heritage assets and Zone of Theoretical Visibility (Hub Height)
  - Figure 11.2: Proposed development layout and non-designated heritage records
  - Figure 11.3: Panoramic Photomontage visualisation from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654)
  - Figure 11.4: Photomontage Visualisation from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654), east of cairn mound
  - Figure 11.5: Photomontage Visualisation from close to Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3653), Lochorodale Woods
  - Figure 11.6: Wireframe Visualisation from Killellan dun (SM3670)
  - Figure 11.7: Wireframe Visualisation from Achnaclach Fort (SM3692)
  - Figure 11.8: Wireframe Visualisation from Cullan Doon Fort and Dun (SM3090)
  - Figure 11.9: Wireframe Visualisation from Kilchrist Dun (SM3640)
  - Figure 11.10: Wireframe Visualisation from Bealloch Hill (SM3639)
  - Figure 11.11: Wireframe Visualisation from Cnoc Araich (SM3648)
- 11.3 The chapter is supported by two Technical Appendices (as set out within Volume 4: Technical Appendices), comprising:
- Appendix A: Designated Heritage Assets Gazetteer; and
  - Appendix B: Non-designated Heritage Assets Gazetteer.
- 11.4 Other relevant chapters include Chapter 6: Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment Chapter 14: Forestry (Chapter 14) and Chapter 7: Socio-economics and Tourism.
- 11.5 This chapter was prepared by competent experts Craig Stewart and Dr Tori Park. Craig Stewart is a Consultant in WSP's Cultural Heritage team, with 8 years' experience in heritage consultancy. Dr Tori Park is an Associate Director in WSP's Cultural Heritage team, with 14 years' experience in the cultural heritage sector. Both experts hold membership of the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (CIfA): Craig Stewart at Practitioner grade (PCIfA) and Dr Tori Park at Associate grade (ACIfA).

## Legislation, Policy and Guidance

### Legislation

11.6 Certain assets that are deemed to be of particular importance are given legal protection. The importance of heritage assets and the protection of these and their settings is recognised in legislation as well as national, regional and local planning policy. The following legislation is relevant to the assessment of the effects on Historic Environment receptors:

- Paragraph 3(2) of Schedule 9 of the Electricity Act 1989 requires the Scottish Ministers, in considering any relevant proposals for which their consent is required under Section 36 of the Act, to have regard to the desirability of protecting sites, buildings and objects of architectural, historical or archaeological interest. Where the person who formulated the proposals is a licence holder, the duty under paragraph 3(1)(b) requires that person who formulated the proposals to do what they reasonably can to mitigate any effect that the proposals would have on any such sites, buildings or objects.
- The Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (AMAAA) provides for a schedule of monuments which are protected and sets out measures for their protection and management. Provisions of the AMAAA are amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014;
- The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act) provides for the definition and protection of a list of buildings and areas of architectural and historical interest and sets out the requirement to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the buildings or their settings in considering development proposals.
- Historic Environment (Scotland) Act 2014, which further amended provisions of the above Acts and established Historic Environment Scotland.

### Policy

11.7 Chapter 5: Renewable Energy and Planning Policy of the EIA Report sets out the renewable energy and planning policy framework that is relevant to the EIA process and the proposed development. The policies set out include those from the National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) and the Argyll and Bute Local Development Plan (LDP).

11.8 Planning Policy issues relating to Cultural Heritage are set out in Table 11.1, below.

**Table 11.1 Planning Policy Issues relevant to Cultural Heritage**

| Policy Reference                  | Policy Issue                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>National Planning Policies</b> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| NPF4: Policy 11 (Energy)          | Policy 11 (e) identifies a number of considerations which are likely to be relevant when determining proposed energy infrastructure developments, including “ <i>vii. impacts on the historic environment</i> ”. |

| Policy Reference                                | Policy Issue                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|-------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| NPF4: Policy 7 (Historic assets and places)     | <p>Protection and enhancement of the historic environment forms part of the Scottish Government's national spatial strategy set out on page 7 of NPF4.</p> <p>The policy intent for Policy 7 is to “protect and enhance historic environment assets and places, and to enable positive change as a catalyst for the regeneration of places.””.</p> <p>In relation to listed buildings, Policy 7(c) states that “Development proposals for the reuse, alteration or extension of a listed building will only be supported where they will preserve its character, special architectural or historic interest and setting. Development proposals affecting the setting of a listed building should preserve its character, and its special architectural or historic interest.”</p> <p>In relation to scheduled ancient monuments, Policy 7(h) states “Development proposals affecting scheduled monuments will only be supported where:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. direct impacts on the scheduled monument are avoided;</li> <li>ii. significant adverse impacts on the integrity of the setting of a scheduled monument are avoided; or</li> <li>iii. exceptional circumstances have been demonstrated to justify the impact on a scheduled monument and its setting and impacts on the monument or its setting have been minimised.””.</li> </ul> <p>In relation to gardens and designed landscapes, Policy 7(i) states that “Development proposals affecting nationally important Gardens and Designed Landscapes will be supported where they protect, preserve or enhance their cultural significance, character and integrity and where proposals will not significantly impact on important views to, from and within the site, or its setting.”.</p> <p>In relation to archaeology, Policy 7(o) states that “Non-designated historic environment assets, places and their setting should be protected and preserved in situ wherever feasible. Where there is potential for non-designated buried archaeological remains to exist below a site, developers will provide an evaluation of the archaeological resource at an early stage so that planning authorities can assess impacts. Historic buildings may also have archaeological significance which is not understood and may require assessment.</p> <p>Where impacts cannot be avoided, they should be minimised. Where it has been demonstrated that avoidance or retention is not possible, excavation, recording, analysis, archiving, publication and activities to provide public benefit may be required through the use of conditions or legal/planning obligations. [...]””.</p> |
| PAN 2/2011 Planning and Archaeology (July 2011) | This document provides advice to planning authorities and developers on dealing with archaeological remains.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Historic Environment                            | The document is designed to support and enable good decision-making about changes to the historic environment. HEPS sets out a series of                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

| Policy Reference                                  | Policy Issue                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Policy for Scotland (HEPS)                        | principles and policies for the recognition, care and sustainable management of the historic environment.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Argyll and Bute Local Development Plan (LDP) 2015 | <p>SG LDP ENV 15 – Development Impact on Historic Gardens and Designed Landscapes</p> <p>SG LDP ENV 16(a) – Development Impact on Listed Buildings</p> <p>SG LDP ENV 17 – Development in Conservation Areas and Special Built Environment Areas</p> <p>SG LDP ENV 19 – Development Impact on Scheduled Ancient Monuments</p> <p>SG LDP ENV 20 – Development Impact on Sites of Archaeological Importance</p> <p>Policy SG LDP ENV 15 requires that development that would affect a garden or designed landscape or its setting demonstrate that the impact of the development upon that asset has been assessed and that adequate measures will be taken to preserve and enhance the special interest of the asset. Measures to mitigate against impact are likely to include enhanced physical access, interpretation and the provision of an open space or landscaped buffer zone, as appropriate.</p> <p>Policy SG LDP ENV 16(a) requires development affecting a listed building or its setting shall preserve the building or its setting, and any features of special architectural or historic interest that it possesses. Where development would affect a heritage asset or its setting the developer will be expected to satisfactorily demonstrate that the impact of the development upon that asset has been assessed and that measures will be taken to preserve and enhance the special interest of the asset. The use of appropriate design statements and conservation plans are expected to facilitate this assessment.</p> <p>Policy SG LDP ENV 17 notes a presumption against development that does not preserve or enhance the character or appearance of an existing or proposed Conservation Area or its setting, or a Special Built Environment Area. Where development would affect these areas or their setting the developer will be expected to satisfactorily demonstrate that the impact of the development upon that special area has been assessed and that measures will be taken to preserve and enhance the special interest of the asset. The use of appropriate design statements, conservation plans, character appraisals etc. are expected facilitate this assessment.</p> <p>Policy SG LDP ENV 19 states there will be a presumption in favour of retaining, protecting and preserving Scheduled Monuments and the integrity of their settings. Developments that have an adverse impact on Scheduled Monuments and their settings will not be permitted unless there are exceptional circumstances.</p> <p>Where development could affect adversely a heritage asset or its setting the developer will be expected to satisfactorily demonstrate that the impact of the development upon that asset has been assessed and that measures will be taken to preserve and protect the special interest of the asset. The use of appropriate archaeological assessment, setting analysis, design statements, conservation plans, character appraisals etc. are expected to facilitate this assessment.</p> <p>Policy SG LDP ENV 20 notes a presumption in favour of retaining, protecting, preserving and enhancing the existing archaeological heritage and any</p> |

| Policy Reference | Policy Issue                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                  | future discoveries found in Argyll and Bute. When development is proposed that would affect a site of archaeological significance, the prospective developer is advised to consult the Council and its archaeological advisors (WoSAS) at the earliest opportunity, and assessment of the importance of the site will be provided by the prospective developer as part of the application for planning permission or (preferably) as part of the pre-application discussions. |

## Guidance

- 11.9 Planning authorities are directed to the HEPS, Historic Environment Circular 1, Planning Advice Note (PAN) 2/2011 and Historic Environment Scotland (HES)'s Managing Change in the Historic Environment guidance note series in their consideration of planning applications affecting the historic environment. The most relevant of the Managing Change series are Managing Change in The Historic Environment: Setting (2019) and Managing Change in The Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes (2019).

## Consultation

- 11.10 As part of the Scoping exercise, a consultation process was undertaken to inform the design of the proposed development and to seek agreement on potential significant environmental effects that result from the proposed development as well as the scope of any assessment work required as part of this EIA.
- 11.11 Scoping Opinions were received from HES on 9th September 2022 and from West of Scotland Archaeology Service (WoSAS) on behalf of Argyll and Bute Council on 12th May 2023. Updates to HES were submitted through the Gatecheck Report and provision of design freeze, turbine array layouts with draft visualisations, to ensure agreement on the assets assessed. Responses from HES were received on 14<sup>th</sup> December 2022 and 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2022 respectively. The key points of these responses are set out below in Table 11.2.
- 11.12 Consultation relevant to the Cultural Heritage assessment was undertaken with HES and WoSAS who commented on aspects of methodology, sources of information, scope of assessment and cumulative development. A summary of these consultation responses is provided in Table 11.2.

**Table 11.2: Consultation Responses**

| Consultee | Date Received | Consultation Response(s)                                                                                           | How and where is this addressed?                                                                                                                                                       |
|-----------|---------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| HES       | 09/09/22      | HES noted approval of the 10km Extended Study Area, and the initial list of heritage assets of interest presented. | The initial list of heritage assets formed the focus of the site and receptor visit carried out in December 2022; the Extended Study Area of 10km used throughout chapter research and |

| Consultee | Date Received | Consultation Response(s)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | How and where is this addressed?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|-----------|---------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|           |               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | preparation: Scope of Assessment, Identification and Assessment of Key Effects                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| HES       | 14/12/2022    | HES agreed to the scoping out of Largiebaan Shielings (SM7147) and Lochorodale Cup-marked Rock (SM3719), concern noted over potential significant effects on receptors in Study Area and Extended Study Area                                                                           | Largiebaan Shielings and Lochorodale Cup-marked Rock not assessed further: Identification and Assessment of Key Effects                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| WoSAS     | 10/05/23      | WoSAS requested the consideration of Non-Statutory Register (NSR) records as part of WoSAS SMR in the study area to a distance of 5km and ensure effects are assessed, and the consideration of effects through disturbance on surviving archaeology within proposed development area. | Two NSR features have been assessed after location confirmed within ZTV: Assumptions and Limitations, Identification and Assessment of Key Effects                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| HES       | 23/05/23      | HES requested the composition of photomontages for Lochorodale Cairns (SM3654, SM3653) to aid in settings assessment and requested the additional assessment of Bealloch Hill forts (SM3639) and Cnoc Araich (SM3648) following design freeze layout confirmation                      | Bealloch Hill and Cnoc Araich have been assessed, photomontages have been produced for Lochorodale Cairn (SM3654) and alternative visualisation provided for Lochorodale Cairn (SM3653). The viewpoint photomontage for Lochorodale "Northern" Cairn (SM3653) was not taken as the key views from the cairn are associated with the loch, downhill to the northwest. The turbines to the west were not considered significant concerns during early stages of the project and not proportionate to what the early assessment suggested. Assumptions and Limitations, Identification and assessment of key effects |

## Scope of Assessment

### *Effects Assessed in Full*

11.13 The following effects were considered to be potentially significant in relation to Cultural Heritage at the scoping stage, informed by HES' initial Scoping Opinion and subsequent consultation in December 2022 and have been assessed in full within this chapter:

- Effects by disturbance on heretofore unrecorded archaeological remains within the Site boundary.
- Effects to the setting of the following Scheduled Monuments:
  - SM3653 Lochorodale, long cairn 1000m NW of;
  - SM3654 Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of;
  - SM3670 Killellan, dun 325m E of Killellan Lodge;
  - SM3692 Achnaclach, fort 680m NW of;
  - SM3090 Cullan Doon, fort & dun 450m ENE of Uigle;
  - SM3640 Kilchrist, Dun 450m ESE of;
  - SM3639 Bealloch Hill, Forts ;
  - SM3648 Cnoc Araich, Fort N Of High Machriemore ;
  - SMR3328 Pennygown Cairn ; and
  - SMR2955 Largybaan Enclosure .

### *Effects Scoped Out*

11.14 Effects to the setting of the following Scheduled Monuments were scoped out in consultation with HES in December 2022, owing to the assets' settings being unaffected by the proposed development:

- SM3719 Largybaan, shielings 750m SW of; and
- SM7147 Lochorodale, cup-marked rock 1100m WNW of.

### *Cumulative Effects*

11.15 There are ten operational, consented or in-application wind energy developments in the area between 10 and 30km north of the Site, with a further operational turbine at Kildalloig c 10km to the east. No other wind energy developments are presently operational within the 10km around the Site and the proposed development would be the first of its scale in the interior area of Kintyre south of Campbeltown. In order to consider the effects of the proposed development when taken in combination with other wind energy developments, the cumulative baseline established for the Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment (Chapter 6) has been used.

## Assessment Methodology and Significance

### Study Area

- 11.16 A study area of 500m ("the Study Area") from the boundary of the Site was established in consultation with Historic Environment Scotland (HES) and WoSAS in May 2023 (see Figure 11.2). This Study Area was defined to allow relevant data to be collected in order to allow an assessment of the potential presence of archaeological remains within the Site. A search was made of the WoSAS Sites and Monuments Record and the HES spatial datasets of designated heritage assets in this area.
- 11.17 An extended study area of 10km ("the Extended Study Area") from the Site was also determined in consultation with HES in Summer 2022 (See Figure 11.1) and WoSAS in Spring 2023 in order to consider assets which may be subject to change to setting. A search was made of the HES spatial datasets of designated heritage assets within this Extended Study Area, in addition to the WoSAS sites and monuments record (SMR) records to a distance of 500m and WoSAS non-statutory register (NSR) records within the SMR dataset to a distance of 5km.

### Desk Based Study and Data Sources

- 11.18 The gathering of baseline data was carried out in accordance with the principles of Standard and guidance for historic environment desk-based assessments (Chartered Institute for Archaeologists [CIfA], 2014).
- 11.19 For the purpose of establishing the historic environment baseline, the following sources have been consulted:
- National and County-based registers of known archaeological and historical sites;
  - Cartographic and historic documents;
  - Aerial photographs;
  - Historic Landuse Assessment (HLA) mapping;
  - Published sources;
  - Internet sources; and
  - Previous archaeological assessments of the area.
- 11.20 These sources were obtained from the following organisations:
- Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland (RCAHMS) (National Monuments Record Scotland (NMRS), accessed via Canmore;
  - The West of Scotland Archaeology Service (WoSAS) Sites and Monuments Record (SMR);
  - Historic Environment Scotland (HES);
  - The National Archives of Scotland; and
  - National Library of Scotland Map Library.

## Field Survey

- 11.21 A series of visits were made to the Site and relevant designated assets in the extended Study Area between 12th and 16th December 2022. Previously identified designated heritage assets were visited to assess the nature of their respective settings, with the Site visited to characterise present ground conditions, land-use and likely impact on archaeological survival.

## Assessment of Significance

- 11.22 The levels of effect upon a heritage asset for either direct or indirect effects would largely depend upon its level of importance and the potential magnitude of change as a result of the proposed development. Tables 11.3 and 11.4 respectively provide details on how the historic environment assessment would establish importance and magnitude of change, which would then inform the conclusion as to the level of effect upon the asset based on a matrix approach set out in Table 11.5, this being tempered by professional judgement as necessary.
- 11.23 The rationale contained within Table 11.3 is predominantly based on information provided within the NPF4 (Scottish Government, 2023) and the associated supporting documents; HES Policy Statement (HES, 2019) and the Scottish Planning Policy Historic Environment Circular 1 (HES, 2019b). Note that the categorisation of the relative importance of those assets which are of less than national importance generally relies on professional judgement.

**Table 11.3: Categorisation of Importance**

| Importance                        | Rationale                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| High (National and International) | <p>World heritage sites are designated on the basis of 'Outstanding Universal Value' and would normally be considered of international importance.</p> <p>By legal definition, Scheduled Monuments are considered as being of national importance. As the process of scheduling is ongoing and as scheduling is a representative designation, there are further assets which are not scheduled but which may be of equivalent importance.</p> <p>HES describes Category A listed buildings as buildings of national or international importance, either architectural or historic; or fine, little-altered examples of some particular period, style or building type (HES website - Categories of listed building).</p> <p>NPF4 states that sites identified within the Inventory of Historic Battlefields and the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes are of national importance.</p> <p>Conservation areas rated by HES as of Outstanding quality (where such appraisals have been made) could be considered as being of national importance.</p> |
| Medium (Regional)                 | <p>These include archaeological sites which do not merit scheduling but which are nevertheless of interest or which could make a substantial contribution to established regional research agendas.</p> <p>HES describes Category B listed buildings as buildings of regional or more than local importance; or major examples of some particular period, style or building type, which may have been altered (HES website - Categories of listed building).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

| Importance         | Rationale                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|--------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                    | The principles of selection for designation of conservation areas do not explicitly include valuations of national, regional or local importance, although most examples would be of importance on a regional level.<br><br>Designed landscapes that are recognised by local authorities but not included within the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes would usually be considered to be regionally important. |
| <i>Low (Local)</i> | The majority of non-designated assets would normally be considered of local importance.<br><br>HES describes Category C listed buildings as buildings of local importance; lesser examples of any period, style or building type, as originally constructed or moderately altered; and simple, traditional buildings that group well with other listed buildings (HES website - Categories of listed building).           |
| <i>Lesser</i>      | These include those features which are no longer extant, where there are no further known or surviving remains (e.g. locations of previous archaeological work), or where assets may have minimal importance, such as modern quarries.                                                                                                                                                                                    |

**Table 11.4: Magnitude of Effect**

| Magnitude         | Criteria                                                                                                                                                              |
|-------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <i>High</i>       | <i>Total or substantial change to an asset or complete alteration of the characteristics of an assets' setting.</i>                                                   |
| <i>Moderate</i>   | Partial alteration of an asset. Substantial change to the key characteristics of an asset's setting, or a more total alteration which is temporary and/or reversible. |
| <i>Low</i>        | Minor alteration of an asset. Changes to a setting which do not affect the key characteristics, or which is short term and/or reversible.                             |
| <i>Negligible</i> | Minor alteration of an asset. Minor and short term or very minor and reversible changes to its setting which do not affect the key characteristics.                   |

**Table 11.5: Significance of Effects Matrix**

|                   | Importance         |                    |                        |                        |
|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| Magnitude         | High (National)    | Medium (Regional)  | Low (Local)            | Lesser                 |
| <b>High</b>       | <b>Significant</b> | <b>Significant</b> | <i>Not significant</i> | <i>Not significant</i> |
| <b>Moderate</b>   | <b>Significant</b> | Not significant    | Not significant        | Not significant        |
| <b>Low</b>        | Not significant    | Not significant    | Not significant        | Not significant        |
| <b>Negligible</b> | Not significant    | Not significant    | Not significant        | Not significant        |

## Assumptions and Limitations

- 11.24 During the walkover survey, every effort was made to visit locations where detailed setting assessment was requested by consultees. However, not all locations were visited, and where this was the case, other methods were used, such as topographic information, ZTV,

aerial photography, and google earth mapping, to support the assessment and mitigate this limitation.

- 11.25 The May 2023 pre-application opinion from HES on the design freeze turbine layout, in addition to noting additional assets for assessment, included requests for photomontage visualisations in relation to two assets assessed within this chapter: Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of (SM3654) and Lochorodale, long cairn 1000m NW of (SM3653) and expressed preferences for further discussion informed by photomontages from the scheduled dun/fort sites assessed. The Viewpoints set out by the LVIA Team in Autumn/Winter 2022 that the photomontages were based on do not include assets aside from Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of (SM3654) as the inclusion of other assets for visualisation was not at the time considered proportionate to the assessment. While this is acknowledged as a limiting factor in setting effects assessments, methods have been utilised to offset the limitations include observations on the assets' setting based on receptor visits and wireframe visualisations.

## **Baseline Conditions**

### ***Location, topography and geology***

- 11.26 The Site is located in an area of commercial woodland, 5.5km south-west of Campbeltown on the Kintyre peninsula, Argyll and Bute.
- 11.27 The Site occupies an upland area west of the B842 road after it passes Knocknaha with topography defined by steep hillsides rising to Cnoc nan Gabhar and Cnoc Odhar in the south and The Slate in the northwest with a watercourse (Achabraad Glen/Homeston Burn) running east-west through the approximate centre, parallel with an existing road at the eastern extent. Land use is primarily characterised by commercial forestry interspersed with rough pasture.

### ***Previous investigations within or adjacent to proposed development area***

- 11.28 Prior investigation of cultural heritage resources within the Site has been characterised by ad-hoc observations made in forestry surveys recording shielings at Allt Criche<sup>1</sup> and a field visit by WoSAS at Lecknacreive Burn and Allt Airighe Glaise<sup>2</sup>. A programme of archaeological survey (SMR4717) was carried out immediately south-east of the proposed development area in 2011. This recorded building remains associated with a farmstead at Ballybrennan.).

## **Chronology**

### ***Prehistory and Romano-British (c. 15000 BCE – 450CE)***

- 11.29 Prehistoric activity within the Site is represented by a single designated heritage asset; the scheduled Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of (SM3654) in addition to a potential non-

---

<sup>1</sup> Information provided to WoSAS by DoE, 1973 following Ordnance Survey report, 1959. WoSAS record 2936

<sup>2</sup> Information fed into monument records 21225 and 21226 by WoSAS following field survey in 1997

designated cairn recorded at Craigaig Water/The Slate (SMR68021). The latter feature was recorded during forestry operations and few details are known.

- 11.30 Beyond the Site, the scheduled Lochorodale, long cairn 1000m NW of (SM3653) is located 925m to the north with a scheduled cup-marked stone located 635m to the north within a forestry plantation (SM7147). No remnants of settlement associated with this period have been recorded within the Site or its immediate surroundings. It is believed that pre- Late Bronze Age settlement in this area would have been transient, producing minimal physical remains. This stands in contrast to the evidence for upland enclosed settlements associated with these later periods within the study area. Scheduled duns and forts at Killellan, 495m to the north-east (SM3670); Achnaclach 490m to the north-east (SM3692); Cullan Doon 2.7km to the north-east (SM3090) and Kilchrist Dun 2.9km to the north-east (SM3640) all match this form and are all sited on points of high land with apparent orientation to valleys, tracks and bodies of water. The NSR recorded enclosure at Largybaan (SMR2955) appears to also reflect this pattern.
- 11.31 It is possible that the siting of funerary monuments in the form of long cairns within the Site and its immediate surroundings precluded any concentration of longer term settlement activity. The isolated nature of Pennygown Cairn, a non-designated NSR feature 2.3km east of the Site (SMR3328) from contemporary features beyond other potential cairns and cup-marked rocks would seem to reflect this distance from settlement.
- 11.32 The potential for further archaeological remains associated with the prehistoric period is anticipated to be **low** within the Site, with the exception of the area around the scheduled Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) within the site. Here, the potential for further associated remains is anticipated to be **high**, with any remains likely to be of **high** importance.

#### *Early historic to medieval periods*

- 11.33 Within the Site, the early historic to medieval periods are represented by eight recorded shieling huts at Allt Criche (SMR2936) 365m west of turbine position T4. In addition, a recorded shieling hut and dykes at Allt Airighe Glaise (SMR21225) and four at Lechnacreive Burn (SMR21226), are present towards the centre of the Site, 205m south-east of turbine position T8.
- 11.34 The pattern of activity within the Site would have been characterised by the expansion of agriculture throughout the early medieval and medieval periods. The presence of shieling huts within the Site indicates this area was subject to pastoral farming on a seasonal transhumance basis. Historic Landscape Assessment data records an area of medieval/postmedieval settlement and agriculture in the south of the Site.
- 11.35 The potential for as yet unknown remains associated with the early historic and medieval periods is considered to be **low**, with any such remains likely tied to transhumance pastoral practices and likely to be of **low** importance.

#### *Postmedieval to modern periods*

- 11.36 Within the Site, the post-medieval to modern periods are represented by the recorded shielings described above (SMR2936, SMR21225, SMR21226). In addition, farmsteads and

head-dykes are recorded at Dalsmirren, Glen Breackerie/Achnaslishaig (SMR45174) and Allt na Boin Dubhe (SMR45169). Immediately south-east of the Site, a walkover survey in 2011 (SMR4717) recorded the remains of a farmstead, comprising twelve sets of earthen and stone banks associated with 19<sup>th</sup> century drainage, eighteen circular shielings, two drystone structures, associated platforms, an area of peat cutting and a track. The farmstead is recorded on the 1<sup>st</sup> edition Ordnance Survey map of 1869 and the structures recorded within the walkover survey indicated a larger farmstead than depicted at this date.

- 11.37 Activity within the Site and The Study Area within this period would have seen a change from medieval and earlier agriculture to the changes in land use and management brought on by the clearances. Landholdings of the Dukes of Argyll in Kintyre were subject to the auctioning of tacks (leases) of farmsteads and townships in the 1710s<sup>3</sup>. This was in effect an event which led to the breakup of townships in favour of crofts and relocation of township inhabitants toward the coast. As the clearances progressed, land in the Kintyre interior including the Site would have been given over to rough pasture and any existing townships, effectively, depopulated. Roy's map of the Highlands (1747-52)<sup>4</sup> and George Langlands' map (1771-1810)<sup>5</sup> show a sparse pattern of isolated farmsteads south of Campbeltown, including within the Site. Ordnance Survey mapping from the first edition onwards shows the Site as open and pastoral land until the late 20<sup>th</sup> century<sup>6</sup>. Commercial forestry plantations are visible in aerial imagery as early as 1985 in the south-west of the Site, having expanded to the east and north by 2004<sup>7</sup>.
- 11.38 There is a high potential for survival of structures or archaeological remains associated with the postmedieval to modern periods, most likely shielings and former field boundaries indicative of rough pasture farming given the previous records and investigations within and immediately adjacent to the Site. Such remains are anticipated to be of **low** importance.

### ***Future Baseline***

- 11.39 In the event of no development taking place, use of land within the Site is anticipated to continue to be characterised by cyclical commercial forestry planting interspersed with rough pasture/deer runs.

---

<sup>3</sup> Allan I. Macinnes (1988). "Scottish Gaeldom: The First Phase of Clearance". In Devine, T M; Mitchison, Rosalind (eds.). *People and Society in Scotland, Volume 1, 1760–1830*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers Ltd.

<sup>4</sup> Accessed via National Library of Scotland

<sup>5</sup> *ibid*

<sup>6</sup> *ibid*

<sup>7</sup> Google Earth Imagery

## Identification and Assessment of Key Effects

### *Assessment of Effects on Cultural Heritage through disturbance*

*SM3654 Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of*

#### Importance

- 11.40 The Lochorodale chambered long cairn is located just within the Site and 840m north-east of the nearest turbine (T10) on a rough-grazed hillside, oriented east-west the Homeston Burn. This monument is a long cairn; a stone-built funerary monument of Neolithic date, typically characterised by a rectangular or trapezoidal mound between 20m and 125m long and typically flanked by quarry ditches or inter-cutting pits from which construction material would be obtained. Long cairns are predominantly found in upland areas in north and western Britain, with the Clyde Group, of which this monument forms part, being a regional grouping in western Scotland<sup>89</sup>. Collective inhumation (burial) tends to be associated with these monuments. Severely disturbed by stone-robbing, it appears as a grass-grown stony mound of irregular outline, measuring 23m in length and 15 m wide and standing up to 1.2 m in height. The chamber measures about 4.3 m in length by up to 1.2 m in width internally. As set out within the RCAHMS inventory entry, at the broader (west) end there remain six large upright slabs, protruding between 0.3 m and 1.2 m above turf level; they comprise part of the southern half of a flat facade, the inner and outer portal-stones on the southern side of the entrance to the burial-chamber, and the terminal slab and one side-slab of the chamber itself. In addition there are two large slabs now lying prone, one of them within the forecourt area and the other in such a position as to suggest that it was originally the northernmost orthostat of the northern half of the facade.
- 11.41 As a Scheduled Monument it is of **high** (national) importance for archaeological and historic interest. While the historic robbing of the cairn structure may have compromised the potential evidential yield from future investigation, potential remains for the feature to grant information about its construction history. In addition, the general form of the monument and its hillside location (discussed further below) mean it is a key example of its monument-type, characterising its historic interest.

#### Nature and significance of effects

- 11.42 None of the proposed turbine locations or associated infrastructure would directly disturb this monument. While there is an existing road which borders the monument to the immediate north, this would not be used for access and therefore **no effects** are anticipated.

#### *Surviving archaeological remains within the Site*

- 11.43 The potential for hitherto unrecorded archaeological remains within the Site of earlier date than the postmedieval period is **low**, with the exception of the **high potential** for remains associated with the scheduled Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) to be present with the

<sup>8</sup> Pouncett, J. 2008 'The Neolithic Period' in Adkins, R; Adkins, L and Leitch, V. *The Handbook of British Archaeology*, 45

<sup>9</sup> Darvill, T., 2002 *Oxford Concise Dictionary of Archaeology*, Oxford University Press, 92

Site. The connection with the scheduled monument means these remains have the potential to be of **high** importance. However, site infrastructure, and proposed construction phase works are located away from this area and the public road passing the monument through the eastern half of the Site would not be used by construction traffic. As a result, no change is anticipated and there would be **no effect**.

- 11.44 There is a **high potential** for postmedieval or early modern period remains in the form of shielings to be present. This is demonstrated by ad-hoc forestry survey within the Site in addition to the investigation at Ballybrennan to the immediate south-east of the same. Remains would be of **low** importance deriving from historic and archaeological interest associated with seasonally variable pastoral practices. The construction phase has potential to remove such features completely or damage them substantially through deforestation or demolition in preparation for turbine position installation or associated infrastructure. This would result in a **major** magnitude of change to assets of **low sensitivity** and the effect would be **not significant** in the absence of mitigation.

### ***Assessment of Effects on Cultural Heritage arising through change to setting***

*SM3654 Lochorodale, long cairn 505m SW of*

#### **Importance and Present Setting**

- 11.45 The **high** importance of this monument is set out in paragraph 11.40-11.41. It sits immediately within the Site, at a distance of 840 m north-east of the nearest turbine (T10).
- 11.46 The nature of the monument's setting is characterised by its hillside location and east-west orientation along a steep river valley. Views from the monument give a sense of being 'enclosed' by rising topography to the north-west and south (see Plate 11.3) in addition to screening provided by commercial woodland. The clearest open view from the monument is to the north-east (see Plate 11.2), showing open land framed by hills in the far distance.
- 11.47 Views of the monument as it is approached from the north-east via a steep ascent on the road and a visible mound centred in near views place emphasise its prominence (see Plate 11.1) in the landscape. The contribution of the monument's setting is considered a key component of its historic importance in helping to understand and appreciate the monument's siting in the landscape.

#### **Change to Setting**

- 11.48 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility for seven turbines to tip height (T7-10 and T11-13) from the monument itself in an arc from the north-west to south-west. Six of those turbines would be visible to hub height, with this number likely reducing to five or four accounting for local screening of afforested areas (Fig 11.1, Fig 11.3, Fig 11.4). A further aspect of the monument's setting that would be affected by the proposed development is the view of the monument as it is approached uphill from the north-east. Turbines would gradually appear in views to the west and south-west as the viewer approaches from the north-east. The visible turbines

would, in westward views, appear as three clusters north to south (T7 and 8, T9 and 10, T11 to 13) with clear separation between one another. Turbines 7-10 would appear beyond the edge of rising topography to the north and west, with the three turbines in the southern array appearing at lesser heights behind ridgelines north-west to south-west (T11, T12 and T13 in turn).

*Plate 11.1. View of Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking south-west from north-eastern approach*



*Plate 11.2. View from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking north-east*



*Plate 11.3. View from Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654) looking south/south-west, valley in foreground with ridgelines visible*



### Significance of Effect

- 11.49 As set out in paragraph 11.47, the clear long view from and to the monument is associated with the north-east. Turbines would not be added to views to the north-east from the monument. Turbines would introduce a new visual element in views south-west from the monument, but the key views contributing to the setting of the asset would remain unaffected. Further to this, the proposed development would affect the view of the monument approached uphill from the north-east. While turbines would appear in reduced number from this view compared to views outward from the monument (the ZTV indicates four to six turbines would be visible to blade tip and one to three to hub height), the gradual appearance of the turbines while approaching the monument may have an effect on its perceived prominence. In spite of this, the physical prominence in the landscape and historic importance would still be legible. The centrality of the cairn within its valley setting framed by ridgelines means the new visual elements would not detract from the appreciation or understanding of the monument. The magnitude of change introduced by the proposed development is considered to be **low**, and the effect would be **not significant**.

*SM3653 Lochorodale, long cairn 1000m NW of*

### Importance and Present Setting

- 11.50 The second Lochorodale Long Cairn located 965m north of the Site and 1.3km north-east of the nearest turbine (T6), is set on a low ridge at 135m OD overlooking the southern end of Loch Orodale. The monument is currently visible as a turf mound, trapezoidal in plan and rising to a maximum height of 1.8m over a length of 17.5m oriented north-west to south-east. Four large stone tops are visible above the turf near the north-western end of the cairn, taken by the RCAHMS inventory entry to be the remains of the terminal slab and side-slabs of a central chamber measuring 2.1m in length by 0.9m to 1.2 width internally.
- 11.51 The monument is of high (national) importance as a result of archaeological and historical interest. As with the Lochorodale cairn described in paragraph 11.40 this is a Neolithic funerary monument of the Clyde Group.
- 11.52 The setting of the cairn is defined by its location in relation to Loch Orodale. The cairn's location on a hillside sloping downward to the loch creates a sense of the monument overlooking this feature (See Plate 11.4), suggesting deliberate siting. The Loch appears in middle distance views arcing from the north to the west from the cairn.

*Plate 11.4. View from Northern Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3653) looking north/north-west toward Loch Orodale*



### Change to Setting

- 11.53 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility for seven to nine turbines at hub height with up to nine turbines visible to blade tip height (eight with present tree screening effect - Figure 11.5). The proposed development would result in turbines visible in four approximate clusters in an arc from north-west to south-west which would include parts of the view of Loch Orodale and the ridgelines behind, however they would appear behind ridgelines rather than in any foreground views.

### Significance of Effect

- 11.54 Presence of the turbines of the proposed development would introduce a new modern visual element into the setting of the monument. However, the turbines would appear beyond the ridgeline noted above but are not considered likely to interfere with the relationship to Loch Orodale or the associated 'bowl' valley to the north and west. The turbines would appear 'beyond the edge' of the key aspects of setting. this would not affect the ability to understand and appreciate the monument's historical nor archaeological interest. Its presence and location within the landscape would largely remain. The magnitude of change arising as a result of the presence of the proposed development is therefore considered to be **low** and would result in a **not significant** effect.

*SM3670 Killellan, dun 325m E of Killellan Lodge*

**Importance and Present Setting**

- 11.55 Killellan dun is located 495m north-east of the Site, and 2.8km north-east of the nearest turbine (T11). The Scheduled Monument comprises a later prehistoric/early historic dun (an enclosed hilltop settlement) situated in this case on a small conical hill overlooking South Killellan Farmstead to the south. The dun measures approximately 8m by 6m and turf covered walls appear up to 2m wide, with an outer wall visible halfway down the hill. A visible ramp to the east indicates the dun would have been approached from this direction, following an approach from a valley floor to the north. The hillsides are steep to the south and north, with a lower terrace to the west. A wall is visible on the south-west corner of the terrace with a sub-rectangular banked enclosure located to the west. The dun's surroundings are characterised by similar steep hills interspersed by a low, flat area of ground to the north-east of the monument, gradually rising northward toward the track through Killellan farmstead south of Achnaclach Fort (discussed below).
- 11.56 The monument is designated as being of high(national) importance owing to archaeological and historic interest. It is a relatively well-preserved example of a later prehistoric/early historic enclosed upland settlement and has the potential to yield evidence of domestic life and architecture associated with these periods in the event of further direct investigation.
- 11.57 As noted above, the immediate surroundings of the dun are defined by sharp topographical relief. Looking out from the dun there is a sense of prominence in the landscape, both through long distance visibility to the north, north-east, west and south direction and particularly through middle distance views north-east in the direction of Achnaclach fort (SM3692) (See Plate 11.5). The importance of this later direction to the monument is reinforced by the probable approach to the dun from the north and east. The general sense is one of a commanding position with views of the immediate areas over which the hill presides. This setting contributes toward the historic interest as a prominent monument in the landscape.

*Plate 11.5. View from Killellan Dun (SM3670) looking north. Achnaclach Fort (SM3692) in middle-distance*



### **Change to Setting**

- 11.58 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates, the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility of 10 to 13 of the proposed turbines to blade tip and hub height, reducing to seven to nine turbines to hub height visibility (without any change in tip height) in the southern half of the scheduled area (Figure 11.6). The wireframe visualisation from the centre of the monument itself indicates a full array of thirteen turbines will be visible in long distance views to the west, with visual separation being created by local topography and screening by tree cover in afforested areas, with visibility to hub height in the case of T1-7 and T12 and 13. Stacking would also be evident in the case of T1 and 6, in addition to T5 and 8. The proposed development would result in the new visible element in views from the monument in the distance toward the west. The eastern approach to the monument at a near distance from a hill 35m to the east, and the valley floor to the north has theoretical visibility of one to three turbines to blade tip and hub height.

### **Significance of Effect**

- 11.59 The key features of the Killellan dun's setting are considered in this assessment to be the approach to the hill from the north and east in addition to views out in that direction. The

views in that direction in particular give the impression of a commanding position of the dun. The addition of new, modern visual elements in long views to the west are not considered to profoundly affect the setting as visibility would not be added to key views to the north-east and visibility in approaches to the monument from this direction would be partial and glimpsed. As such the magnitude of change introduced by the proposed development is considered to be **low** and would be **not significant**.

*SM3692 Achnaclach, fort 680m NW of*

### Importance and Present Setting

- 11.60 Achnaclach is a scheduled monument comprising a prehistoric fort located 960m north-east of the Site, and 3.1km north-east of the nearest proposed turbine (T11). This monument comprises an Iron Age fort surviving as a substantial turf-covered wall enclosing a 100m by 37m area on the narrow top of an elongated ridge oriented north-west to south-east. The fort is located to the north of Conieglen Water and occupies a hilltop 170m above sea level. A gap in the north-west of the enclosing wall marks the position of the entrance, with the easiest point of access being a gentle ascent from a saddle at the north-west end. As the fort is accessed from a track to Achnaclach farmstead and an approximate spur from this track to the north-east, this necessitates circling back along the north-east boundary.
- 11.61 Achnaclach is of high (national) importance owing to archaeological and historical interest. The high potential of the fort to yield evidence through future investigation into the nature and occupation of upland fortified settlement in this region, in addition to its unusually large size contributes to the archaeological interest. The same unusual size in addition to a commanding presence over its immediate surroundings, including the Conieglen Water and associated valley and routeways, characterises the monument's historic interest.
- 11.62 The fort is something of an outlier in Argyll being located inland, though the location appears to have been carefully selected. Aside from the natural defence stemming from the hilltop's location, the fort commands views along Conieglen and the Achnaclach trackway on the valley floor to the east. In addition, the fort has intervisibility with Killelan Dun, 375m to the south-west which contributes to an understanding of its historic interest in the wider landscape. The setting of the fort is partly affected by the presence of a disused quarry to the north-west.

### Change to Setting

- 11.63 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility of 10-13 turbines, and wireframe visualisations (Figure 11.7) indicate that all thirteen turbines would be visible to hub height from the fort. Stacking would be evident in the case of turbines T2 and T3, and the array would appear as a largely discreet feature with some separation between turbines as viewed from the monument, particularly in turbines T11, T12 and T13. The presence of the proposed development would present a new, modern, visual element in long distance views to the west.

## Significance of Effect

- 11.64 As set out above, Achnaclach fort's setting is principally tied to its orientation along the north-west to south-east ridge, intervisibility with the nearby Killelan dun and position overlooking routeways, Conieglen water and valley floors. The appearance of the proposed development in longer views to the west would be clear, but is not considered to impose on the experience, understanding nor appreciation of the monument in the wider landscape nor its historical value or associations with other monuments, particularly Killelan Dun (SM3670) to the south and Bealloch Hill (SM3639) to the north-west. This would result in a **low** magnitude of change resulting in a **not significant**.

*SM3090 Cullan Doon, fort & dun 450m ENE of Uigle*

## Importance and Present Setting

- 11.65 Cullan Doon is a Scheduled Monument covering the remains of a fort and later dun, both likely occupied in the later prehistoric to early historic periods located 2.7km from the Site and 4.9km from the nearest proposed turbine (T10). The monument is located on the crest of a narrow ridge overlooking Chiskan water and Uigle farmstead from its position to the north of both. The ridge is approached from the north-west, with natural protection afforded from all other directions by the flanks of the ridge. The fort remains are in a poor state of preservation, with little visible beyond the terraced seating for a wall running along the south-west flank of the hill although no stonework remains and likely robbed for the later dun construction. The dun measures 24.5m by 18.5m within a stone wall which is now represented on all sides except the north-east by a band of debris which is spread to a thickness of up to 6m; one short stretch of outer facing-stones is visible at the southern corner. The entrance faces north-west,. Two series of quarries (interpreted as works relating to the monument's later dun phase, provide finishing material for the walls and/or an additional defensive measure) are cut along the spine of the ridge. The innermost of these quarries appears to have formed an outwork to the dun with a causeway opposite its entrance on the north-west.<sup>1011</sup>
- 11.66 As a Scheduled Monument it is considered of high (national) importance as a result of its archaeological and historical interest. While the initial fort phase of occupation has been degraded and disturbed in terms of visibility at ground level, the potential for evidence of phases and timing of occupation to be revealed by future archaeological investigation remains. In addition, while the fort phase's legibility is compromised the later dun phase, any surviving archaeological remains would still provide an effective example of this site-type.
- 11.67 The setting of Cullan Doon is characterised by its immediate surroundings, with views tied to and oriented along the Chiskan Water to the south. Chiskan Water passes the monument on its south side before a sharp turn to the north-west toward Knocknaha. The monument is set against rises in topography to the north and north-east with views opening out south and westward. Quarrying of likely contemporary date along the ridge's spine

---

<sup>10</sup> RCAHMS. 1971 The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. Argyll: an inventory of the ancient monuments, volume 1: Kintyre. Edinburgh. Page(s): 69, No. 162 plan RCAHMS Shelf Number: A.1.1.INV/18

<sup>11</sup> <http://hillforts.arch.ox.ac.uk/records/SC2206.html>

serves to focus views within the monument away from the north-west parts. The fall in topography to the south and south-west provides views over the Chiskan Water and Uigle Farmstead to the south-west, granting a sense of the fort and dun as 'presiding over' this area. This setting contributes to the historic interest of the monument by allowing the landscape context in which it was sited to be appreciated.

### Change to Setting

- 11.68 The ZTV indicates the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility to hub height of 10-13 turbines (Figure 11.1) to the west, with wireframe visualisations indicating hub height visibility of the full turbine array (Figure 11.8). These would appear largely as one coherent group but with some separation between the northern and southern parts of the array. Stacking would be visible in the case of T2 and 1, in addition to T10 and 9.

### Significance of Effect

- 11.69 The setting of the monument is tied to longer views to the south associated with the Chiskan water and valley. The addition of turbines in long distance views to the west is not considered to impact on the understanding or appreciation of the monument beyond the edges of these southern views. This would add new elements to views from the monument to a small degree but would not fundamentally alter the understanding or appreciation of the asset. This is considered to be a **low** magnitude of change which would be a **not significant effect**.

*SM3640 Kilchrist, Dun 450m ESE of*

### Importance and Present Setting

- 11.70 Kilchrist is a Scheduled Monument located 2.9km north-east of the Site and 5.1km north-east of the nearest turbine position (T10) comprising a dun occupying a rocky knoll on a downward slope at the north-west corner of a rough pasture field. The monument overlooks the Killeonan Burn to the north as it runs south-east to north-west. The dun, oval in plan, stands at a height of 90m OD, and measures 10.5m by 7.5m internally. Its wall has been severely robbed, and now appears as a band of debris about 3m in thickness. Except for a single stone of the outer face, situated 1.8m below the crest of the slope on the north-east, the facings have all been removed.
- 11.71 The outworks are now reduced to low stony banks, or to scarps. The inner bank encloses the dun on all sides except the north and north-east where the steep slope to the burn affords sufficient natural protection. The outer bank is designed to cover the approach from the south-east; at this end the outer bank was evidently linked to the inner bank, while the north-west end the outer bank terminates against a rock outcrop.
- 11.72 Kilchrist dun is a Scheduled Monument of high (national) importance owing to archaeological and historic interest. While parts of the structure have been degraded through historic stone robbing there remains a potential for future investigation to yield evidence relating to the construction, occupation and domestic architecture of the dun. In addition, this dun provides an illustrative example of its type, particularly through its

conspicuous appearance in the landscape as it is approached from the south via the natural outcrop on which it is situated.

- 11.73 The dun's setting is driven by its presence on a natural outcrop and in relation to the Killeonan Burn running east-west immediately to the north. The dun's position on a natural 'edge' directs views toward and along the burn valley and further to the north-east, where Campbeltown and the natural harbour of Campbeltown Loch appears as features in the distance. Views back toward the south and west are characterised by rising topography and open vistas with hills in the far distance respectively, with glimpses of the Category B-listed Kilchrist Castle in the foreground of north-west views along the burn.

### Change to Setting

- 11.74 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the monument is located within an area with theoretical visibility of 10-13 turbines to hub height. Wireline visualisation (Figure 11.9) indicate that all thirteen turbines would be visible in long distance views to the west and south-west from the monument, with twelve of these visible to hub height. This would introduce a clearly modern visual element in views to the west and south-west, though undulating topography in the middle distance would provide a degree of visual separation.

### Significance of Effect

- 11.75 The presence of the turbine array in long distance views to the west and south-west would affect the setting of this monument, though not in a way that would compromise the setting's integrity. As noted above the key views from Kilchrist dun are focused along the Killeonan Burn to the east and north-west, determined by the monument's position on the southern edge of the burn valley. Views northward are also drawn to the inlet of Campbeltown harbour. Although the proposed development would be visible, given that the affected views are not considered key parts within the setting of Kilchrist Dun the magnitude of change is considered likely to be **low**, and the resulting effect would be **not significant**.

*Bealloch Hill, Forts (SM3639)*

### Importance and Present Setting

- 11.76 Bealloch Hill, Forts is a Scheduled Monument within an area of rough pasture located 2.1km north-east of the Site and 3.6km north-east of the nearest turbine position (T6), comprising a later prehistoric hilltop settlement at a hill summit 150m AOD. An Ordnance Survey site visit in 1924 noted "the remains of two successive forts" at the hill's summit. A series of archaeological excavations between 1973 and 1978 elaborated on the occupation, dates and phases of the enclosed areas. The innermost wall visible at the ground surface presents as a rubble mound enclosing an area of 40m north-west to south-east by 27m transverse. The ground level-visible outer wall encloses an area measuring 58m north-west to south-east 44m transverse, with the rampart appearing as a scarp. A third wall, exterior to the former two and with associated shallow dug slots either side of its line, was recorded during the excavations. The excavation programme recorded evidence for occupation and storage structures within the enclosed areas, in addition to associated radiocarbon dates placing the broad phase of the enclosed areas

occupation at the 8<sup>th</sup>-1<sup>st</sup> centuries BC, with 3<sup>rd</sup>-1<sup>st</sup> century BC occupation better represented. In addition, a double cremation burial of Middle Bronze Age type was recorded beneath the innermost rampart and radiocarbon dated to an uncalibrated mid-1<sup>st</sup> millennium BC date. Whether there was significance associated via the burial with an earlier phase of occupation here is uncertain.

- 11.77 Bealloch Hill Forts is a scheduled monument of high (national) importance owing to archaeological and historic interest. The monument's enduring archaeological interest is attested to by the results of previous excavations attested in paragraph 11.76, pointing to a complex sequence of occupation and fortification in an upland settlement of later prehistoric date. Potential for earlier occupation/use of this area hinted by the presence of Middle Bronze Age burial demonstrates enduring archaeological interest that future investigation could pursue and the presence of the inner and middle ramparts at ground level illustrate its status as an upland enclosed settlement of this later prehistoric period, demonstrating historic interest.
- 11.78 The monument's setting contributes to historic interest through the monument's position in relation to local topography: The presence of the Tirfergus Hill summit of 260m AOD 1.3km south-west of the asset and sharp decline in ground level to the east and north-east associated with the valley floor toward Killeonan ensures views from the asset are oriented north-east toward Machrihanish Water, Stewarton and Campbeltown. These views demonstrate a commanding presence of Bealloch Hill's position along lower lying land and routeways, in addition to potential visibility from Kilchrist Dun (SM3640), Cullan Doon (SM3090) and Achnaclach Fort (SM3692). In doing this they characterise the setting of the monument and contribute heavily toward its historic interest.

### Change to setting

- 11.79 The ZTV (Figure 11. 1) indicates is located within an area with theoretical visibility of four to six turbines to hub height or 10-13 turbines to blade tip from the scheduled area itself. Turbines would appear in long-distance views in an arc from the west to south-west (Fig 11.10), interrupted by middle distance topography and intermittent screening via commercial forestry planting. The turbines would introduce a new, visibly modern visual element in views from the monument in this west to south-west, in addition to background features in any views of Bealloch Hill from Kilchrist Dun (SM3640), Cullan Doon (SM3090) or Achnaclach Fort (SM3692).

### Significance of effect

- 11.80 The presence of turbines in longer distance views in a west-south arc from this monument would alter the monument's setting in parts of the outward long distance views marginal to the appreciation of its historic interest. The south-western rise in topography toward Tirfergus Hill and the Site orientates views to the east and north-east; these views would be unaffected and the sense of a commanding prominence associated with the fort largely preserved. The archaeological interest would be unaffected. This would present a **low** magnitude of change that would be **not significant**.

### *Cnoc Araich, Fort N of High Machriemore (SM3648)*

#### **Importance and present setting**

- 11.81 Cnoc Araich is a Scheduled Monument comprising a hillfort located 3.9km south-east of the Site and 4.7km south-east of the nearest turbine position (T13). The monument is situated on a hill spur overlooking High Machriemore farm to the south, with longer views over a low-lying area to the village of Southend. The hillfort defenses enclose an irregular area of 2.53ha and consist of at least three rings of ramparts and ditches, which are exceptionally well-preserved on the northern and western sides. The interior of the fort has been cultivated in the past, small quarries have been cut into the defenses around the margins of the hill and much of the defenses were overgrown with gorse as of 2016.
- 11.82 This is a Scheduled Monument of high (national) importance derived from historic and archaeological interest. The monument provides an illustration of an unusually large, enclosed hill settlement overlooking a coastal plain within this region. No excavations are recorded at the monument, and future investigations have the potential to yield valuable information about its occupation and use, increasing understanding of prehistoric settlement in Argyll.
- 11.83 The setting of the monument is characterized by views outward in most directions; southward to High Machriemore farm and eastward to the valley of Conieglen water, with further southward visibility toward the coast at Southend. Views north from the monument look over the valley framing the B842 running south-north and westward views show a slight rise in topography. The incline within the monument and its position over the coastal plain orients views to the south and south-east, weighting these views in their contribution to the setting character of the monument.

#### **Change to setting**

- 11.84 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the monument is within an area indicating visibility for four to six turbines at blade tip (Figure 11.11). These blade tips would appear in long distance views to the north-west with intervening topography providing some visual separation. Views to the south and south-east would be unaffected, and the blade tips would effectively “frame” the edge of views northward.

#### **Significance of effect**

- 11.85 The presence of new visual elements in longer distance views to the north-west would alter part of the monument's setting. As the blade tips would appear at a distance in views in this direction, the impression of the monument overlooking low-lying land and the valley floor would be largely uncompromised. Key southward views would be unchanged, this would amount to a **low** magnitude of change, that would be **not significant**.

### *Pennygown Cairn (SMR3328)*

#### **Importance and Present Setting**

- 11.86 Pennygown Cairn is located 2.3km east of the Site, and 4.7km north-east of the nearest turbine (T11). The feature is located within an area of forestry (currently clear with afforested area to the west, last visibly planted c 2004 per satellite imagery<sup>12</sup>) and has been described as a cairn standing at a height of 194m OD, overgrown by turf and rushes, measuring 9m diameter and 1.1m height. Potential national importance has been assigned to this asset on the basis of its site type and associated archaeological and historic interest: Potential archaeological evidence of a funerary monument associated with the asset and an illustration of the site type provided by surviving remains at ground level. A survey report dated to 1977 notes the asset's "mutilation" by ploughing and tree-planting.<sup>1314</sup>
- 11.87 While not formally designated, this feature is recorded in the WoSAS NSR as an asset of "probable" national importance. Accounting for the erosion archaeological and historical interest as a result of ploughing and tree planting this feature is viewed as of medium (regional) importance.
- 11.88 The setting of the cairn is characterised primarily by its hilltop location, set back from busy main roads and the rural context associated with farming and commercial forestry, with topography falling then undulating in middle to long distances outward from the asset. The commercial forestry aspect adds a dynamic, changing element to this setting through the cycle of afforestation and deforestation adding and removing screening in different near and middle distance views of and from the feature over time. This setting is considered to make a contribution to the feature's importance through the perceived height and prominence of the feature.

#### **Change to Setting**

- 11.89 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates the feature is located within an area with theoretical visibility of 10 to 13 of the proposed turbines at hub height. This would add a new, visibly modern element in views to the west. While views in this direction from the asset are currently screened by tree cover, this would open up during the operation of the proposed development as the cycle of afforestation and deforestation continues.

#### **Significance of effect**

- 11.90 While the new visual element would undoubtedly be noticeable, the distance from the nearest turbine position (T11, 4.7km) indicates there would be a clear visual separation through distance and landform between its location and that of the turbines, further enhanced by the fall and rise again in topography westward ensuring the turbines do not appear in the foreground of views. The key element of this feature's setting is interpreted

---

<sup>12</sup> Google Earth Satellite imagery, change in forestry cycle noted between 2004 and 2007.

<sup>13</sup> RCAHMS 1971. The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. Argyll: an inventory of the ancient monuments, Vol 1: Kintyre. 704149 cclxii (unnoted) Edinburgh.

<sup>14</sup> Ordnance Survey visit, 5 October 1977, recorded in WoSAS HER entry

here as a closer relationship to nearby landforms and watercourses. This would present a **low** magnitude of change to the cairn. This would be **not significant** effect.

#### *Largybaan Enclosure (SMR2955)*

### **Importance and Present Setting**

- 11.91 Largybaan Enclosure is located 2.2km south-west of the Site, and 2.9km south-west of the closest turbine (T1). This feature is an oval enclosure measuring 15.5m north-west -south-east and 12.5m transverse within a “rubble” wall 0.2m high and 3.0-3.5m thick. The enclosure is located on a relatively low-lying turf-covered knoll. No clearly identifiable entrance was located during a 1977 survey visit, though evidence of an interior rectangular structure was noted<sup>15</sup>. Though not formally designated, the feature has been recorded in the NSR as an asset of “probable” national importance. For the purpose of this assessment, this feature is viewed as of high (national) importance.
- 11.92 The setting of this asset is drawn primarily from its immediate, localised surroundings in relation to nearby topography and watercourses. Longer views effectively serve to “frame” this area with distant hills providing contrast to the land close to and associated with the enclosure itself, the general impression being of the enclosure as a farmstead overlooking its associated land.

### **Change to Setting**

- 11.93 The ZTV (Figure 11.1) indicates Largybaan Enclosure is located within an area of theoretical visibility for one to three turbine positions (T1, T2, T4) at hub height with two additional turbines (T3, T5) visible to blade tip. This would introduce a new modern visual element in longer distance views from the feature. Turbines would appear behind rises in topography and with a screening effect associated by trees in afforested areas rather than in any foreground views from the monument.

### **Significance of Effect**

- 11.94 The presence of turbines in longer views from the Largybaan Enclosure is not considered to impose on the integrity of the feature's setting. The nature of the assets, and the shorter distance views linking the asset to its immediate surroundings and associated land would remain unaffected. The magnitude of change introduced by the proposed development is anticipated to be **negligible**, and it would be **not significant**.

### **Decommissioning Effects**

- 11.95 The effects of decommissioning would effectively be the removal of the new visual element introduced by the proposed development in addition to potential effects arising from the decommissioning process itself or the temporary occupation of land. The effects would generally be temporary and of limited duration and are anticipated to be **negligible**.

---

<sup>15</sup> Ordnance Survey visit, recorded in WoSAS HER record

## Cumulative Effects

- 11.96 Within 10km of the Site a single windfarm is currently in scoping, pending application (Windfarm S01, High Dalrioch, Figure 6.12), 5.5km north-east of the Site. If consented and built, this would appear in views north-east from Kilchrist Dun (SM3640) and Achnaclach Fort (SM3692) and east of Cullan Doon (SM3090). It is to be noted that as High Dalrioch is at the pre-application (scoping) stage, it represents the worst-case layout included in the cumulative assessment, and is likely that the number and height of the turbines could change should an application be submitted.
- 11.97 The proposed development's appearance in long distance views to the west/south-west of these assets is not anticipated to result in a significant adverse effect. In combination with a completed High Dalrioch windfarm, it is not anticipated that the magnitude of change would be anymore significant, as no key views from the heritage assets are impacted upon by either windfarm. This would provide a low magnitude of change in each case that **would not be a significant effect**.

## Mitigation Measures and Monitoring

- 11.98 Potential effects on surviving archaeology within the Site would be mitigated in the first instance by avoidance of the scheduled area around the Lochorodale Long Cairn by ensuring no upgrades to the road are made for construction traffic. As the design freeze includes the use of an access approach that avoids this area with abnormal loads, this is considered adequate mitigation.
- 11.99 The presence of features within the Site (primarily shielings) identified in forestry survey in addition to the results of the survey immediately to the south-east indicate a high potential for survival of similar features within the Site. Effects on these features during the construction phase could be effectively mitigated by an agreed programme of archaeological works prepared in consultation with Argyll and Bute Council and subject to condition. The programme methodology would be set out in a written scheme of investigation (WSI) and could incorporate pre-deforestation survey and an archaeological watching brief.

## Residual Effects

- 11.100 A summary of residual effects assessment is provided in Table 11.6, presented below.

**Table 11.6. Residual Effects**

| Potential Receptor and Effect                                        | Magnitude of Change | Receptor Sensitivity | Significance: Construction | Significance : Operation | Significance: Decommissioning | Significance: Cumulative | Summary Rationale                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Disturbance of previously recorded heritage assets within the Site   | Low                 | High                 | Not significant            | N/A                      | N/A                           | N/A                      | Design of proposed development infrastructure precludes any disturbance of the identified feature (Lochorodale Long Cairn CM3654) or associated remains.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| Disturbance of previously unrecorded heritage assets within the Site | Low                 | Low                  | Not significant            | N/A                      | N/A                           | N/A                      | Mitigation strategy entailing archaeological monitoring agreed with LPA would preclude significant effects.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Effect on character and setting of Lochorodale Long Cairn (SM3654)   | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant          | Not significant               | Not significant          | Turbines would appear in views to west and south-west, while the key components of setting for this asset are considered to be views to the north-east and shorter views to an adjacent valley floor and watercourse.                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Effect on character and setting of Lochorodale Cairn (SM3653)        | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant          | Not significant               | Not significant          | The key element of this monument's setting is associated with Loch Orodale and the landform "bowl" in which it is situated. Turbines would appear beyond this and, while a clear new visible element, would not impose on the setting of the monument.                                                                                                                                    |
| Effect on character and setting of Killellan dun (SM3670)            | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | N/S                      | Not significant               | Not significant          | Key setting components for the monument are considered to be approaches from the north, middle range views of the valley floor below and intervisibility with Achnaclach (SM3692) to the north, with middle views in other directions communicating the dominant position of the dun. Turbines would be visible in long distance views but are not anticipated to impose on this setting. |

| Potential Receptor and Effect                                                       | Magnitude of Change | Receptor Sensitivity | Significance: Construction | Significance: Operation | Significance: Decommissioning | Significance: Cumulative | Summary Rationale                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Effect on character and setting of Ach-na-clach Fort (SM3692)                       | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | Achnaclach's setting is characterised by its position overlooking nearby routeways, watercourses and intervisibility with Killelan dun (SM3670) and a position overlooking valley floors and lower-lying ground into the middle and longer distance in all directions. Turbines would appear in longer views west/south-west with visual separation created by clear changes in topography and are anticipated to be a clearly perceptible modern feature that does not compromise the integrity of setting. |
| Effect on character and setting of Cullan Doon, fort and dun (SM3090)               | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | Cullan Doon's setting is principally characterised by views to and along the valley floor associated with Chiskan Water in the short to middle distance to the south, east and west. Longer views in all directions create a sense of dominant siting in relation to these areas. Turbines would appear clearly visible with a visual separation effect based on changes in topography. The array would be clearly visible but not impose on the integrity of the setting.                                   |
| Effect on character and setting of Kilchrist dun (SM3640)                           | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | The key views from Kilchrist dun are oriented along the Killeonan Burn to the east and north-west, determined by the monument's position on the southern edge of the burn valley. Views northward are also drawn to the inlet of Campbelltown harbour. Affected views to the south-west are not considered integral to the asset's setting.                                                                                                                                                                  |
| Effect on character and setting of Bealloch Hill, Forts (SM3639)                    | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | Key views outward from the monument are oriented toward the east and north-east and would be unaffected, though turbines would appear in views to the west and south-west. The sense of prominence associated with the monument's setting would be preserved.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| Effect on character and setting of Cnoc Araich, Fort N of High Machriemore (SM3648) | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | While setting would be affected by the addition of turbines in longer distance views to the north-west the monument's key visual relationship overlooking the coastal plain to the south and south-east would be unaffected.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |

| Potential Receptor and Effect                                    | Magnitude of Change | Receptor Sensitivity | Significance: Construction | Significance: Operation | Significance: Decommissioning | Significance: Cumulative | Summary Rationale                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Effect on character and setting of Pennygown Cairn (SMR3328)     | Low                 | Medium               | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | While the new visual element would undoubtedly be noticeable, the distance from the Site of this feature indicates there would be a clear visual separation between its location and that of the turbines, influenced by the fall and rise again in topography westward. The key element of this feature's setting is interpreted here as a closer relationship to nearby landforms and watercourses. |
| Effect on character and setting of Largybaan Enclosure (SMR2955) | Low                 | High                 | N/A                        | Not significant         | Not significant               | Not significant          | The presence of turbines in longer views from the Largybaan Enclosure is not considered to impose on the feature's setting as articulated above (shorter distance views between the asset and immediate surroundings interpreted as associated land).                                                                                                                                                 |

## Summary

- 11.101 This chapter considers the effects of the proposed development on Cultural Heritage. The assessment has identified ten potential receptors for significant effects via changes to the setting of heritage assets (eight Scheduled Monuments within an Extended Study Area of 10km, two identified features of potential national importance within 5km of the Site) in addition to a high potential for archaeological remains of prehistoric, medieval and post-medieval date within the Site.
- 11.102 While the proposed development would introduce a new, visible and clearly modern visual component to views of and from the receptors assessed, none of the associated effects are considered to be more than minor adverse and no significant effects are anticipated in association with setting. The construction of Site infrastructure has potential to remove previously unrecorded archaeological remains within the Site but following an agreed programme of mitigation through preliminary walkover survey and/or on-site monitoring of access works and turbine installation this is not considered a significant effect.

## References

- Adkins, R. Adkins, L. and Leitch, V. (2008) *The Handbook of British Archaeology* (2nd edn). Constable, London
- Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979. Available at <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1979/46/contents> (Accessed: 01 December 2022)
- Argyll and Bute (2015) Argyll and Bute Local Development Plan Written Statement, Adopted March 2015 [https://www.argyll-bute.gov.uk/sites/default/files/migrated\\_files/written\\_statement\\_0\\_1\\_ac\\_0.pdf](https://www.argyll-bute.gov.uk/sites/default/files/migrated_files/written_statement_0_1_ac_0.pdf), accessed 03/10/2022, reviewed 03/07/2023
- BGS (2020) *Geology Viewer of Britain*. Available at <https://mapapps.bgs.ac.uk/geologyofbritain/home.html>. Accessed 03/10/2022.
- ClfA, (2017) *Standard and Guidance for Historic Environment Desk-Based Assessments*.
- Darvill, T. (2002) *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Archaeology*. Oxford University Press
- Devine, T.M, (2019) *The Scottish Clearances: A History of The Dispossessed, 1600-1900*, Penguin, London
- Gordon, J. ed. *The New Statistical Account of Scotland / by the ministers of the respective parishes, under the superintendence of a committee of the Society for the Benefit of the Sons and Daughters of the Clergy*. Campbelton, Argyle, Vol. 7, Edinburgh: Blackwoods and Sons, 1845, p. 456. University of Edinburgh, University of Glasgow. (1999) *The Statistical Accounts of Scotland online service*: <https://stataccscot.edina.ac.uk:443/link/nsa-vol7-p456-parish-argyle-campbelton>, accessed 01/12/2022
- Gordon, J. ed. *The New Statistical Account of Scotland / by the ministers of the respective parishes, under the superintendence of a committee of the Society for the Benefit of the Sons and Daughters of the Clergy*. Southend, Argyle, Vol. 7, Edinburgh: Blackwoods and Sons, 1845, p. 413. University of Edinburgh, University of Glasgow. (1999) *The Statistical Accounts of Scotland online service*:

<https://stataccscot.edina.ac.uk:443/link/nsa-vol7-p413-parish-argyle-southend>, accessed 01/12/2022

Historic Environment (Scotland) Act 2014. Available at <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/asp/2014/19/contents> (Accessed: 31 March 2023)

Historic Environment Scotland (2016) Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting.

Historic Environment Scotland. (2019) Historic Environment Circular 1.

Historic Environment Scotland (2019) Historic Environment Policy for Scotland.

Locke, G. and Ralston, I. (2017) Atlas of Hillforts of Britain and Ireland [ONLINE] Available at: <http://hillforts.arch.ox.ac.uk/>, accessed 01/12/2022

Macinnes, A.I. (1988) 'Scottish Gaeldom: The First Phase of Clearance' In Devine, T M; Mitchison, Rosalind (eds.). *People and Society in Scotland, Volume 1, 1760–1830*. John Donald Publishers Ltd, Edinburgh

Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland (RCAHMS), (1971) *Argyll: an inventory of the ancient monuments, volume 1: Kintyre*. Edinburgh

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. Available at <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1997/9/contents> (Accessed: 01 December 2022)

Scottish Government (2023) National Planning Framework 4 Scottish Government. (2011). Planning Advice Note (PAN) 2/2011: Planning and archaeology.

Sinclair, Sir John. The Statistical Account of Scotland, Campbelton, Argyle, Vol. 10, Edinburgh: William Creech, 1794, p. 538-539. University of Edinburgh, University of Glasgow. (1999) The Statistical Accounts of Scotland online service: <https://stataccscot.edina.ac.uk:443/link/osa-vol10-p544-parish-argyle-campbelton>, accessed 01/12/2022

Sinclair, Sir John. The Statistical Account of Scotland, Southend, Argyle, Vol. 3, Edinburgh: William Creech, 1792, p. 363. University of Edinburgh, University of Glasgow. (1999) The Statistical Accounts of Scotland online service: <https://stataccscot.edina.ac.uk:443/link/osa-vol3-p363-parish-argyle-southend>, accessed 01/12/2022

West of Scotland Archaeology Service (WoSAS). Available at <https://www.wosas.net/> (accessed 31 March 2022)

